

**CITY OF CLEVELAND HEIGHTS
SPECIAL PLANNING COMMISSION
October 29, 2024
MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING**

PRESENT MEMBERS: Jessica Cohen
Michael Gaynier
Judith Miles
Jessica Wobig
Leonard Horwitz

STAFF PRESENT: Brooke Siggers, City Planner
Karen Knittel, Assistant Planning Director
L. Harrison Crumrine , Assistant Law Director
Christy Lee, Recording Sectary

Call to Order

Ms. Cohen called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. and welcomed the audience to the regular Cleveland Heights Planning Commission meetings on October 29, 2024.

Approval of Minutes

Ms. Cohen, Minutes for both August 14, 2024, and September 11, 2024 Meetings were held until the following meeting which will be November 13, 2024

Mr. Crumrine swore in all applicants and staff.

Daniel Caja, 14924 Easter Ave, Lakewood, Ohio, and Erik Loomis, 289 Landplane Lane, affirm the Oath, along with Greg Shumate, 1100 West 9th Street, Cleveland, Ohio, indicating that they are consultations for The Alcazar. All three gentlemen gave an additional overview of the plans for the Alcazar, including how the building will now operate, how apartments have been newly renovated, possible plans for the Community Room on the top floor, and how parking will affect current residents and surrounding neighbors with the new renovations. They added that they have been approved by both the Board of Zoning Appeals as well as the Architectural Board of Review. Adding that if approved for reduction of parking, the current parking spaces will remain short of one that will be used for electrical upgrade. Adding additional bike storage, with the interior and exterior of the structure allow 36 additional spaces.

Greg Shumate came forward stating that Desman a National Parking firm who have performed several parking studies throughout Northeast Ohio and Cleveland Heights. He stated there has been a complete analysis of the new parking system regarding the request for the parking reduction. With 129 units currently in the Alcazar only 72 are occupied, which allowed for the firm to assess the demand for parking. Once all the data was gathered and looking at how the tenants are using the parking spaces the need for the Conditional Use Permit for reduction of parking was the best vision for this area. The consultants and the demand for efficiency units is on the rise, adding to the reason for the reduction of parking.

Ms. Cohen asked with 132 units however there were additional numbers stated, what is the actual number of units, and how many are occupied?

Greg Shumate stated that 129 is the number of existing units that were originally in the building, since the renovations only 72 of the units are in use, when the project is complete that number will go up to 172. The full number of expected occupancies will be considering there are only 3 2-bedrooms and the balance of the remaining are studio apartments and 1 bedroom.

Mr. Horowitz asked what are the plans for the top-floor ballroom.

The consultants stated that the ballroom will remain as is being a tenant's space for recreation, along with a fitness area and lounge.

Ms. Miles asked what is the current demographic for the building.

The Consultants stated there is a mix of newly graduated college students, Grad students, as well as a generation of millennials and empty nesters.

Ms. Siggers Power Point Presentation

Proj. No. 24-27 The Alcazar [RP Derbyshire, LLC], 2450 Derbyshire, 'MF2' Multiple-Family, requests reduction in required parking spaces per Code Chapters 1111, 1115, 1121, & 1161 in order to implement renovations that result in 132 units that require an additional 60 parking spaces.

CONTEXT:

The subject property (parcel no. 685-16-040) is located on Derbyshire Road, and is the building south of the Surrey and Derbyshire Road intersection.

The property is currently a 129-unit apartment building and is being renovated to become a 132-unit apartment building. The Alcazar is located in a MF-2 Multiple Family district that continues to the east with apartment buildings along the south side of Derbyshire Road. To the north, across Derbyshire is an "A" Single Family district. The Alcazar's south property line abuts the Cedar Fairmount Commercial District which is zoned "C-2" Local Retail. The apartment buildings directly across Surrey Road to the west are in a "S-2" Mixed Use District.

REQUEST FOR REDUCTION IN REQUIRED PARKING:

The Applicant is requesting a reduction in the required parking spaces. 132 parking spaces are required by Code, and The Applicant is proposing to provide a total of 73. The Applicant initially requested a variance from the Board of Zoning Appeals on June 26, 2024, and was denied. Board Members had concerns about the building having less than 50 percent of the required parking spaces and asked that a parking study be conducted to indicate that the proposed parking was sufficient for the building's future needs. It was ultimately determined that The Applicant did not demonstrate that the property has special conditions and circumstances that are peculiar to the land and/or structure which are not generally applicable to other land and/or structures in the same zoning district.

HISTORY:

The Alcazar Hotel was built in 1923 and is listed on the National Register of Historic Places and is a designated Cleveland Heights Landmark. This eclectic Spanish-Moorish-style hotel with an irregular pentagon plan is designed around a central courtyard and based on a hotel with the same name in St. Augustine, Florida. The Alcazar was built at a time when apartment hotels served as restful oases for weary travelers, rental residences for the well-to-do, as well as elegant gathering places for the local elite. The Alcazar provided both apartments and hotel rooms. In the early 2000, the State of Ohio Fire Code changed, resulting in The Alcazar becoming an apartment and lodging house with only five bed and breakfast rooms. Due to the flexibility of connecting doors, a resident could rent one efficiency room, or join two or more units together to create a multi-room unit.

2003: Granted a conditional use permit to place twelve (12) cellular antennas on the walls of two (2) elevator shafts on the rooftop of The Alcazar hotel building.

2014: Granted a variance to complete renovations that would result in a 96-unit apartment building, which would require thirty-four (34) additional

parking spaces to be Code-conforming, without providing any additional parking spaces.

2022: Current owner purchased the building with 129 dwelling units and fifty-four (54) on-site parking spaces.

2024: Granted a variance to permit 141 units with maximum land area per dwelling unit to be less than Code-conforming standard; granted a variance to permit sixty-three (63) dwelling units to be smaller than Code-conforming standard; granted a variance to permit the building to be taller than the maximum height of forty-five (45) feet. Denied a reduction in required parking variance to permit a total of 141 dwelling units with existing onsite parking of forty-three (43) spaces when a minimum of 141 parking spaces are required.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The current owner purchased the building in 2022 with a total of 129 existing dwelling units and on-site 52 parking spaces. Since the 2024 BZA hearing, the Applicant has revised their project removing the new units that had been proposed on a portion of the roof. The Applicant is proposing to renovate The Alcazar apartment building, which will result in an additional three (3) dwelling units for a total of 132 units and sixty-eight (68) parking spaces, with 20 of those available parking spaces being located at The Ascent at Top of the Hill.

The Applicant hired DESMAN, Inc. to conduct a parking assessment of the parking needs for the proposed renovations project. The parking assessment demonstrated that the proposed amount of parking spaces is sufficient for the expected demand if the recommended transportation mechanisms are implemented. The assessment shows that only 57% of currently existing parking spaces are occupied, and that the current ratio of existing units to spaces is 0.56. Following the addition of dwelling units and removal of parking spaces through the proposed renovations, the total ratio of proposed units to spaces is 0.52.

Alcazar Apartments Parking Requirement Assessment	Existing Units/ Spaces	Ex. Resid. Parking Demand	Usage % Existing Spaces	Planned Units/ Spaces	Code Required Spaces	Future Parker Demand	Usage % Future Spaces
Residential Units	129			132	132		
Occupied Units	72			132			
Lower -Level Interior Parking Spaces	42	30	71%	40		40	100%
Adjacent Surface Parking Lot Spaces	10	8	80%	8		8	100%
Top-of-Hill Cedar Deck (Reserved Spaces)	20	3	15%	20		20	100%
Totals	72	41	57%	68	132	68	100%
<i>Spaces Per Units</i>	<i>0.56</i>			<i>0.52</i>	<i>1.00</i>		

10% Parking Requirement Reduction Per Ride Share Vehicle		-5	-5	
Adjusted Alcazar Apartments Parking Demand		127	63	

Source: DESMAN, Inc.

DESMAN, Inc. recommended that The Alcazar property owners commit to continuing to lease the twenty (20) existing off-site parking spaces, commit to providing four (4) bicycles and four (4) scooters to be made available for rental, and commit to providing two (2) car share vehicles to be made available for rental. The Applicant also plans to provide four (4) electric vehicle charging units that will be available for the car share vehicles as well as for residents' personal vehicles.

Planning Staff is comfortable with the proposed amount of available parking if the five (5) additional parking spaces can be acquired and if two (2) car share vehicles are provided for residents of The Alcazar. The car share vehicles may be made available to other Cedar Fairmount residents and visitors as well. Additionally, because 29% of newly proposed resident parking is located at The Ascent at Top of the Hill, Planning Staff recommends that The Alcazar consider in renovations plans that they may receive future accommodation requests for additional on-site ADA parking spaces for residents with varying capacities for mobility.

STANDARDS:

1161.05 MODIFICATION OF REQUIREMENTS.

Whenever the parking requirements based on functions and uses, and application of the standards specified in Schedule 1161.03 can be shown by the applicant to result in an excessive number of parking spaces and that a lesser number of spaces is appropriate and consistent with these regulations, the Planning Commission may approve a reduction in required spaces, as a conditional use according to the procedures set forth in Section 1115.08 and the criteria established in Section 1151.02.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission approve the reduction in required parking to permit a 132-unit apartment building to have sixty-eight (68) parking spaces, as shown on the submitted site plan, with the following conditions:

1. This use shall not be injurious to the use and enjoyment of other properties in the immediate vicinity or create a nuisance for adjacent properties;
2. The Applicant is to work with City Staff to resolve any complaints from neighbors;
3. The Applicant is to obtain all required building permits;

4. The Applicant is to complete all construction and landscaping within twenty-four (24) months;
5. The Applicant is to submit a landscaping plan to be approved by the Zoning Administrator;
6. The Applicant is to submit documentation to the Planning Commission of the final parking plan, which is to include at least twenty (20) parking spaces at The Ascent at Top of the Hill, the provision of two (2) car share vehicles to be made available for residents, the provision of four (4) bicycle share vehicles to be made available for residents, and the provision of four (4) scooter share vehicles to be made available for residents;
7. The Applicant is to submit documentation on an annual basis with The Ascent at Top of the Hill or other off-site parking spaces within a similar distance for the utilization of at least twenty (20) parking spaces, as well as official documentation confirming the provision of two (2) car share vehicles, the provision of four (4) bicycle share vehicles, and the provision of four (4) scooter share vehicles to the Zoning Administrator; and
8. The Applicant is to return to the Planning Commission if any changes to the total available number of parking spaces, rental share vehicles, or dwelling units are made.

Ms. Cohen asked if there were any questions for staff.

The question was raised but was not on the recording.

L. Harrison Crumrine swore the public/staff after the motion who had additional comments regarding the case.

Gregory Magino 2493 Derbyshire Rd. Affirmed the Oath he stated that he has been a long-time resident of the area, he wanted to what the plan for the overflow of parking from the surrounding areas. Mr. Magino's main concerns is the overflow however he feels that the project is a great idea.

Ms. Siggers stated that this concern would be something that City Council would be able to answer and solve.

Ms. Knittel interjected that when the parking study was done they also took into consideration the overflow of parking and how it is currently handled. She added that few committees are looking to this how this can be improved and addressed so all can coexist.

Ms. Cohen asked with the currently was there any information regarding the residents are using on-street parking as well as leased parking garage and is there a cost per year for this.

Mr. Shumate stated that he wasn't able to confirm that information. Regarding the lease amount, prices range from \$20.00 to \$50.00 per month.

Ms. Cohen officially closed public comment for this Project.

Mr. Horowitz moved approve for **Proj. No. 24-27 The Alcazar [RP Derbyshire, LLC], 2450 Derbyshire, 'MF2' Multiple-Family**, requests reduction in required parking spaces per Code Chapters 1111, 1115, 1121, & 1161 in order to implement renovations that result in 132 units that require an additional 60 parking spaces. With Staff Recommendation.

Mrs. Miles seconded the motion and it was passed 5-0.

Ms. Cohen noted that on the last condition, the applicant is to return the Planning Commission is that correct? If so annually we'd review and give public notice to the public.

Ms. Knittle Correct a business has to do an annual review, for the reissuing of their Occupancy Licenses and that would be the times at which we collect information about the parking plan so at that time we're able to assist only new information.

David Craun 3300 Mayfield Rd affirmed the oath, he went on to give details regarding the Park Synagogue resubdivision. Mr. Craun stated that he was giving a preview of the resubdivision of the Park Synagogue, he emphasized the urgency of the need for the resubdivision before the end of the year so that it can be registered with the County to propose the financial end of the project which has a lot of public funding including historic tax credits and grants. He went on to detail the differences in all three of the parcels, explain the benefits of the resubdivision with a brief overview of the history as well as the significant of Park Synagogue.

Ms. Cohen asked who the actual owner of the property and what is again is the urgency of having this project completed to receive funding.

Mr. Craun Stainable Community Associates restores historic properties all over the Northeast Ohio area. The Project will receive funding because the historic parcel needs to be transferred over as part of the community arts complex is looking to create an arts consortium, this will

not be just one non-profit but several combined into one. This non-profit must get birth this year to secure funding.

Ms. Siggers Power Point Presentation

Proj. No. 24-29 Park Synagogue, 3300 Mayfield, 'A' Single-Family,
requests lot resubdivision to split PPNs 684-34-001, 684-35-001,
and 684-35-022 per Code Chapters 1111 & 1121.

CONTEXT:

The primary parcel is located at 3300 Mayfield Road and consists of the local Landmark, Park Synagogue, which is currently undergoing restorative renovations. The three (3) subject properties (parcel nos. 684-34-001, 684-35-001, and 684-35-022) have a combined total area of 1,240,287 square feet or 28.5 acres, and are located two (2) lots north east of the Ivydale and Mayfield Road intersection. The properties are zoned 'A' Single-Family, and are neighbored by houses, also zoned 'A' Single-Family to their west, south, and east; and are neighbored by more houses, apartment buildings, and businesses zoned 'MF-1' Multiple-Family to their north.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The applicant requests to resubdivide the primary parcel, being approximately 1,097 feet wide with an area of 761,429 square feet; with the neighboring parcel, approximately 903.5 feet wide with an area of 469,458 square feet; and the Euclid Heights Boulevard access drive parcel, approximately 50 feet wide with an area of 9,400 square feet to create three (3) new lots. All parcels will remain zoned 'A' Single-Family. The resulting parcels will remain code-conforming. The Applicant wants to resubdivide their lot in order to allow space for the development of future senior housing as well as to maintain the existing on-site daycare facility and Mikvah. A Framework Plan for the Park Synagogue property has been underway for the past year, and the initial phase will be submitted in the coming weeks. The multi-phase plan envisions retaining the park-like character of the wooded site, celebrating the architecture of Mendelsohn's synagogue, and exploring opportunities for new buildings. Studies have included small-scale residences such as townhouse apartments on the site's south side near the Synagogue in phase one and more significant multi-family buildings on the north side across the ravine in future phases. The new parcel subdivision lines have been drawn with these opportunities in mind.

REQUEST FOR LOT RESUBDIVISION:

The applicant requests a resubdivision of their parcel under 1111.06(b)(7) and 1121.04(r).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission approve the lot resubdivision to resubdivide the three (3) parcels as shown on the submitted site plan, with the condition that the plan be signed by the Director of Law and Director of Planning & Development prior to submittal to the County Recorder.

Ms. Cohen asked to go back to the zoning map. Requesting clarification code conforming. She also asked if the community center will need a Conditional Use Permit.

Ms. Siggers after the resubdivision the parcels will become all code-conforming parcels.

Ms. Knittel There will be a lot of work that will need to be completed, a preliminary review next month, as well as possible requests for rezoning of this property as well. All the questions regarding the zoning map will have to go before the City Council.

An additional question was asked however they weren't recorded.

Ms. Cohen requested via staff to have either the city communications department or the right place with a landing page, and cite page where the Planning Commission can list what people will need to know information, where things are on the agenda, when the opportunities for them to speak on these topics. Having the link included on the agenda and placed on social media.

Ms. Knittel interjected stating when it was a City-owned property there were landing pages, this is a good consideration and we will look into it.

Adam May 1654 Compton Rd affirmed the oath, Mr. May wanted to express his thoughts on **Proj.No 24-27**, he went on to say that he purchased the property for the seclusion that it provides, however, he understands that changes and improvements are needed to be made, he is just concerned with the actual resubdivision and the lost of privacy for his property.

Ms. Miles motioned approval of Proj. No. 24-29 Park Synagogue, 3300 Mayfield, 'A' Single-Family, requests lot resubdivision to split PPNs 684-34-001, 684-35-001, and 684-35-022 per Code Chapters 1111 & 1121. With Staff Recommendations.

Mr. Horowitz seconded the motion which was carried 5-0.

OLD BUSINESS WXZ submitted a request to extend there Conditional Use Permit allowing more time for construction.

Mr. Gaynier motioned for an extension of time for WXZ for an additional 18 month the motion was Seconded by Mr. Horowitz and carried 5-0.

NEW BUSINESS Ms. Cohen informed the Commission of her invitation to the Cities Administrative Services Committee Meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 8:22 P.M.



Jessica Cohen, Planning Commission Chair

11/13/24

Date



Brooke Siggers, Secretary to the Planning Commission

11/14/2024

Date