

**CITY OF CLEVELAND HEIGHTS
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
AND LANDMARK COMMISSION
MINUTES OF THE MEETING
January 5, 2021**

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW Joseph Strauss, Chair
MEMBERS PRESENT AT REMOTE Denver Brooker
LOCATIONS: Terry Saylor

STAFF PRESENT AT CITY HLL: BreAnna Kirk, Planning Technician
Karen Knittel, Assistant Planning Director

CALL TO ORDER

Ms. Kirk called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM with all the above-listed members present at remote locations joining through the City's WebEx meeting link. Applicants and interested parties also joined using WebEx. Ms. Kirk had technical problems and resumed the meeting at 7:16 PM.

APPROVAL OF THE DECEMBER 15, 2020, MINUTES

Minutes were approved and signed by Mr. Strauss with corrected text per request by Mr. Strauss on the action for case ABR 2020-232.

**PUBLIC HEARING
JANUARY 5, 2021**

ABR 2021-1: St. Ann Parish, 2175 Coventry Road, requests to replace antennas and related equipment at the existing church cell site.

- Ronald Gainar of Ronald A. Gainar, Esq., 2515 Red Fox Pass, 44094, provided a project overview of the equipment replacement on the bell tower of St. Ann's. The equipment is being updated to provide 5G service.

- David Harper of Harper Engineering, Inc., 815 Superior Avenue, 44114, described the technical updates. The replacement cabinets on the roof-level platform are approximately the same size as the existing ones. He said they will not be visible from the street. The new antennas are larger, but will not extend over the face of the bell tower. They will be attached using the existing mounts.
- Ms. Adams asked how far the proposed and current antennas project from the face of the wall. Mr. Harper said the proposed antennas will project 1' 6", and the existing project about 1'. The ledge they are on is 2' 8", so they will not protrude beyond it.

LANDMARK COMMISSION ACTION: Ms. Lann moved to approve the antennas and related cell equipment as shown on Harper Engineering's plans, revised December 22, 2020, understanding the equipment will be painted to match. Seconded by Mr. Edmonson, the motion was unanimously approved.

- Mr. Strauss noted the proposed antennas are shown mounted at different angles and asked if they can be mounted flat against the building like the existing antennas are. Mr. Gainar and Mr. Harper said that radio-frequency engineers dictate the direction of the antennas to meet their coverage objectives.

ABR ACTION: Mr. Strauss moved to approve the antennas and related cell equipment as shown on Harper Engineering's plans, revised December 22, 2020. Seconded by Mr. Brooker, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2021-2: Case Western Reserve, 2163 Harcourt Drive, requests to alter exterior doors and windows.

- Joseph Park of JP Compass, 7948 Mayfield Road, 44026, described the window and door changes. They are completing a kitchen renovation and relocating the back door and windows to make them more functional. The door on the porch will be moved to the location of the existing window, and a window will be installed in place of the existing door. Additionally, a first-floor window on the back elevation (closest to the porch) will be moved to join up with the existing window next to it.
- Ms. Lann asked about the replacement windows, and Mr. Park said they will be Pella Architect Series Reserve. They are aluminum clad with true divided light and a putty glaze detail on the exterior.
- Ms. Adams asked if the porch area would remain a porch. Mr. Park said the area will remain an open porch, they are just changing the path by replacing the window with a door, and replacing the door with a window.
- Ms. Adams asked if the stone lintel above the existing porch door will remain once the door is replaced with a window. Mr. Park said it will be raised to match the height of the others.

- Ms. Lann asked if they selected a door yet, and Mr. Park said it will be a custom wood door to match the existing one.
- Mr. Saylor asked if they will save the light fixture above the current porch door. Mr. Park said that when they move the door, they will also relocate the fixture.
- Ms. Lann said it is difficult to approve changes to window openings in a historic structure, but she supports the project because it is at the rear of the building and because they selected excellent materials. Other members of the Landmark Commission echoed this sentiment, and Mr. Veider said the project is an investment in keeping the house viable as a residence and valuable to Case Western.
- Chris Panichi of Case Western Reserve, 10620 Cedar Avenue, 44106, said the mortar is soft enough where they can believe they can salvage a large portion of existing brick.

LANDMARK COMMISSION ACTION: Ms. Adams moved to approved the window and door changes as shown on JP Compass's plans, received December 21, 2020, understanding that the replacement windows will be aluminum-clad Pella Reserve with true divided light, the replacement door will be wood, the mortar will be matched, and brick will be salvaged.

Seconded by Mr. Edmonson, the motion was unanimously approved.

- Mr. Strauss said he is rarely in favor of bricking up windows or doors because you can always tell what was once there. However, because the alterations are on the back of the home and are not visible from the street, he is okay with the changes.
- Mr. Saylor asked why the new windows will be clad when all the other windows on the home are wood. He also wondered if the window to be removed can be reused. Mr. Panichi and Mr. Park do not think the existing window can be reused because the widths are not the same and the window may be damaged upon removal. Mr. Park said a clad window was chosen for durability and maintenance. Mr. Panichi is okay with a wood window instead of clad as proposed.

ABR ACTION: Mr. Saylor moved to approve window and door changes as shown on JP Compass's plans, received December 21, 2020, with the condition that a wood window is used to replace the existing windows.

Seconded by Mr. Strauss, the motion was unanimously approved.

LANDMARK COMMISSION ACTION: Ms. Adams moved to amend the previous motion to approve the window and door changes as shown on JP Compass's plans, received December 21, 2020, to include the condition that a wood window is used to replace the existing windows. Seconded by Ms. Lann, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2021-3: Michael Green, 2153 North Taylor Road, requests to build a two-car, detached garage.

- Platinum Construction's Nilsa Carrero, 26387 Cannon Road, 44146, described the garage.

ABR ACTION: Mr. Saylor moved to approve the garage as shown on Platinum Construction's plans, received December 4, 2020. Seconded by Mr. Brooker, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2021-4: Lovell Terry, 14437 Superior Road, requests to install new windows.

- Window Nation's Tony Miralia, 4350 Renaissance Parkway, 44128, described the windows. All windows will be replaced like-for-like except two French casement windows to be replaced with double-hung windows. The double-hung windows have a 2x2 grid pattern in the upper sash and no grid in the bottom sash.
- Mr. Saylor asked about the height of the double-hung windows replacing the French casement windows. Mr. Miralia said they are 17.5 inches tall. Mr. Brooker said the four panels in the upper sash will be very small because the window is small. Mr. Saylor suggested one vertical mullion through the entire window because the double-hung window already has a horizontal line through the middle. That line acts as a horizontal mullion, and the addition of the vertical mullion will essentially create a larger 2x2 grid that spans the entire window instead of just the upper sash. He said it will better match the other windows of the home. Mr. Brooker noted it also matches the existing casement windows better.

ABR ACTION: Mr. Saylor moved to approve the windows as shown on Window Nation's plans, received December 22, 2020, with the condition that the double-hung windows replacing the French casement windows have one vertical mullion in the top and bottom sash. Seconded by Mr. Strauss, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2021-5: Cindie Carroll-Pankhurst, 1541 Maple Road, requests to install new windows.

- Jen Sickels of Renewal by Andersen, 17450 Engle Lake Drive, 44130 presented the windows. All windows will be replaced like-for-like except for the non-operational French door at the front of the home, which will be replaced with one large fixed window.
- Mr. Strauss said the proposed window doesn't seem heavy enough to hold the place of doors, which have a heavy frame on the top, bottom, and middle between each door.
- Mr. Saylor asked if the grid sizes in the new fixed window will match and line up with the grids in the double-hung windows that sit on the right and left

sides of the current doors. Ms. Sickels said they would do their best to match the grids on the double-hung windows but she is not sure if they will be an exact match.

- Mr. Brooker asked if Andersen has an option for a fixed window with a heavier bottom sill member. Ms. Sickels said they may be able to install a single panel door that would look similar to the existing doors, but the homeowner would like to get rid of the thick vertical line in the center. Mr. Strauss noted that the French doors to be removed are very similar, if not identical, to the entry doors on the same elevation. He does not want them to compete.
- Mr. Brooker suggested mullions in the upper 1/3 of the fixed window and no mullions in the lower 2/3 to match the double-hung windows on either side. Because of the short wall/railing of the porch, the lower 1/3 of the fixed window will not be visible from the street, and it might look like another double-hung. While this option might look okay from the street, Mr. Strauss said it would not look right from inside the home or on the porch. He said the proposed window seems like the best option.
- Mr. Saylor suggested building out a decorative wood panel that stops at the height of the left and right double-hung window sills. Above the panel would be a picture window, the same height as the double-hung windows, with no dividers to match the feel of the storm doors on the same elevation.
- Mr. Brooker said that because of all the elements that stand in front of the window, (porch railing and arch, posts, and shrubs) the pattern of the proposed window is not significant and will look okay.

ABR ACTION: Mr. Saylor moved to approve the window as shown on Renewal by Andersen's plans, received December 22, 2020, with the condition that the manufacturer matches the windowpane sizes to the left and right double-hung windows as best they can. Seconded by Mr. Brooker, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2021-6: Musicians Towers OH TC LP, 2727 Lancashire Road, requests to install new windows.

- Ms. Kirk said this project was approved by the ABR in February 2019 for windows, an entryway, and a pavilion. They have since decided to alter the plan for the windows.
- Jesse Sweigart of LDA architects, inc., 5000 Euclid Avenue, 44103 presented the new windows. Many tenants in the building use window air conditioning units, so they decided to install PTAC systems in each unit. The window proportions are the same as the approved design, but there will be louvers in one opening where the PTAC unit is. The windows without the louver will be the same size as the old design. The color of the windows and louver will match the concrete building frame.

- Ms. Kirk showed the drawings from the original window plan that was approved in 2019 to compare it with the new plan. The addition of the louvers is the main difference between the two plans.
- Mr. Saylor said the proposed windows are an improvement to the existing windows. He wondered if the louver should be a different color than the window frames to stand out. Mr. Sweigart said they looked at using a darker color for the louver, but he and the owner agreed that matching the window color makes the building look more cohesive. Mr. Strauss agreed it would look best to match the color.

ABR ACTION: Mr. Saylor moved to approve the windows as shown on LDA architects' plans, dated December 15, 2020. Seconded by Mr. Strauss, the motion was unanimously approved.

Old Business

New Business

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 8:45 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,

BreAnna Kirk

BreAnna Kirk, Secretary

1-20-21

date

Approved,

Joseph Strauss

Joseph Strauss, ABR Chair

1-19-21

date